

Using Discretionary Spaces in Teaching to Advance Students' Mathematical Flourishing

Deborah Loewenberg Ball



) @deborah_ball

Baltimore City Public Schools January 23, 2024 • Baltimore, MD

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/



 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Teaching is powerful.

MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Understanding the power of the work of teaching

How is teaching powerful?

What are "discretionary spaces" and what makes them so powerful?

How can we better leverage the discretionary spaces in our work?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/



1. How is teaching powerful?



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION TEACHINGWORKS

> **(cc)** BY-NC-ND This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

Video: Is there a teacher who had a significant impact on you?





(c) BY-NC-ND This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ 2024 Deborab Leowenberg Ball & School of Education & University of Michigan & App Arbor, MI 48109 & dball@un

M MARSAL EDUCATION \approx Teaching Works

Why does it matter when we don't pay attention to the actual work of teaching?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

We fail to connect the dots.

And that means that our strategies often miss the mark of helping students flourish—and reproduce patterns of inequity and injustice.

MARSAL EDUCATION 🛛 🚝 Teaching Works

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

1. Teaching and learning are constructed interactively and are interpretive.



MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

- 1. Teaching and learning are constructed interactively and are interpretive.
- 2. They take place within broad historical and socio-political environments.



 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Histories, policies, institutional systems

(e.g., institutional racism, history of intelligence as the property of white people, anti-Black "scientific" racism; legacies of violence against Black and Indigenous people)

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Histories, policies, institutional systems

(e.g., institutional racism, history of intelligence as the property of white people, anti-Black "scientific" racism; legacies of violence against Black and Indigenous people)

&

Taken-for-granted practices and norms

(e.g., teachers' judgments of students, who is positioned as "smart" or "struggling"; disproportional punishment and assignment to special ed and gifted programs)

MARSAL EDUCATION 🛛 🚝 Teaching Works

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Histories, policies, institutional systems

(e.g., institutional racism, history of intelligence as the property of white people, anti-Black "scientific" racism; legacies of violence against Black and Indigenous people)

&

Taken-for-granted practices and norms

(e.g., teachers' judgments of students, who is positioned as "smart" or "struggling"; disproportional punishment and assignment to special ed and gifted programs)

MARSAL EDUCATION Z Teaching Works

The arrows run both ways.

The environments in which we are all steeped shape what we take for granted and do, but learning these as normal also reinforces their persistence.



CC) BY-NC-ND This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu















CC BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





CC BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu







This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

- 1. **Teaching is powerful**. When it is done with care and judgment, students can thrive—learn content, develop positive identities, learn to value others and work collectively.
- 2. Teaching also involves **enormous discretion**.
- 3. How that discretion is exercised can either reinforce racialized and oppressive patterns of social, personal, and epistemic injustice and harm, or it can **disrupt these patterns.**

CC) BY-NC-ND This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

How can we leverage the power of teaching?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Fractions as numbers: The instructional goal for student understanding

3.NF.2.a

Represent a fraction 1/b on a number line diagram by defining the interval from 0 to 1 as the whole and partitioning it into b equal parts. Recognize that each part has size 1/b and that the endpoint of the part based at 0 locates the number 1/b on the number line.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





Aniyah



Toni

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Viewing focus

What do you see about each girl's mathematical knowledge and skill?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Video: Aniyah and Toni



This video and additional supporting materials are available online <u>here</u>.

MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Discuss

What do you see about each girl's mathematical knowledge and skill?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

M MARSAL EDUCATION \approx Teaching Works

In the next moment, what is likely to happen?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

RESULTS

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

In the next moment, what is likely to happen?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

• "Can someone help Aniyah out and show what we call the whole on the number line?"

RESULTS

• Aniyah is excluded and her mathematical contributions are sidelined.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

In the next moment, what is likely to happen?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

- "Can someone help Aniyah out and show what we call the whole on the number line?"
- "Great, Aniyah, almost! But remember that the whole is from 0 to 1."

RESULTS

- Aniyah is excluded and her mathematical contributions are sidelined.
- Aniyah's answer is signaled to be incorrect and she is positioned as not having contributed to the work.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

3Y-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

In the next moment, what is likely to happen?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

- "Can someone help Aniyah out and show what we call the whole on the number line?"
- "Great, Aniyah, almost! But remember that the whole is from 0 to 1."
- "Thumbs up if you agree with Aniyah; thumbs down if you disagree."

RESULTS

- Aniyah is excluded and her mathematical contributions are sidelined.
- Aniyah's answer is signaled to be incorrect and she is positioned as not having contributed to the work.
- Aniyah's solution is "voted" on by her classmates.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

3Y-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What else is likely?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

RESULTS

What else is likely?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

• "Toni, when you're ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you."

RESULTS

 Toni is publicly excluded from the discussion.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What else is likely?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

- "Toni, when you're ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you."
- "You need to be a better listener, Toni. Aniyah already explained why she picked one-seventh. Who else has a real question for Aniyah?"

RESULTS

- Toni is publicly excluded from the discussion
- Toni is judged to not be listening, her question is judged as not good, and she is excluded from the discussion.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What else is likely?

NORMALIZED NEXT MOVES

- "Toni, when you're ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you."
- "You need to be a better listener, Toni. Aniyah already explained why she picked one-seventh. Who else has a real question for Anivah?"
- "In this classroom, we are respectful of one another. When you are ready to be respectful, you can rejoin the discussion, Toni."

RESULTS

- Toni is publicly excluded from the discussion.
- Toni is judged to not be listening, her question is judged as not good, and she is excluded from the discussion.
- Toni is publicly named and shamed as "disrespectful," rebuked, and her role in advancing the mathematics is sidelined.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 BY-NC-ND International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



M MARSAL EDUCATION \approx Teaching Works

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu
Speaker	Talk	Discretionary space	
Teacher	Who would like to try to explain what you think the answer is? And show us your reasoning by coming up to the board?	1. Deciding when to open whole-group discussion 2. Deciding what to do to launch discussion	
	Who'd like to come up to the board and try to tell-	una cumantan	
	And you know, it might not be right. That's okay because we're learning something new.	3. Framing the expectation for presenting 4. Framing of what it 'coming to the	
	I'd like someone to come up and sort of be the teacher and explain how you are thinking about it. Who'd like to try that this momind?	board' entails	
Teacher	Okay, Aniyah?	5. Selecting a student to present	
Toni	Playing with bair	6. Deciding whether to comment	
Other children	Laying an arms	7. Deciding whether to comment	
Teacher	When someone's presenting at the board, what should you be doing?	 Setting norms for what to do when a student is presenting 	
Students in chorus	Looking at them.	the second s	
Teacher	Looking at that person-	9. Responding to students	
Teacher	'Un-huh?	10. Taking up an individual student question	
Aniyah	You want me to write it?		
Teacher	You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.	11. Clarifying task	
Teacher	Listen closely and see what you think about her reasoning and her answer. (Aniyoh writes 1/7 by the orange line).	12. Setting task for the other students	
Aniyah	put one-seventh because there's-	5 M 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
Toni	Did she say one-seventh?	13. Responding to student	
Aniyah	(turns to Toni) Yeah- (continues to class) Bocause there's seven equal parts, like one, two, there, four, five, six, and then seven. (Uses her fingers to count the parts on the number line).		
Teacher	Before you agree of disagree, I want you to ask questions if there's something you don't understand about what she did.	14. Setting task for responding to student explanation	
	No agreeing and disagreeing. Just- All you can do right now is ask Anlyah questions. Who has a question for her?		
Teacher	Okay, Toni, what's your question for her?	15. Selecting student to speak	
Dante.	You did not!	16. Responding to student speaking across room	
Toni	Why did- (laughs at another student who says samething to her from across the room)	17. Responding to student laughing	
Teacher	Go ahead, it's your lum.	17. Responding to student laughing	
Tonl	Why did you pick one-seventh?		
Dante	You did not	18. Responding to student speaking	
Teacher	Let's listen to her answer now. That was a very good question.	19. Setting task for class	
		was manyonung in seaders	







This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Teaching is dense with "discretionary spaces"





40

CC BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Video: Aniyah and Toni



This video and additional supporting materials are available online <u>here</u>.

MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Using discretionary spaces with care



- Interpreting Toni as asking a real question that she means.
- Hearing Toni's question as central to advancing the mathematical content.
- Reinforcing her mathematical identity, not choosing to read her body as disruptive.



- Interpreting Aniyah as competent to answer questions about her ideas.
- Hearing Aniyah's explanation as central to advancing the mathematical content.
- Reinforcing her mathematical identity, not choosing to read her body as struggling.



- Other children hear Aniyah as getting the discussion going, and Toni as asking an important mathematical question.
- Aniyah and Toni are both positioned as contributing to the discussion.
- Children see a teacher attending to Black girls as mathematical thinkers and contributors to collective work.

MARSAL EDUCATION Z Teaching Works

42

(c) BY-NC-ND This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ 2024 Deborab Leowenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • App Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umicb of

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

14 minutes after where we stopped



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

43



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

ANIYAH

T
I did well on my goal today because my
goal was to to share my ideas with the
Class and I did I want up to the board
and share my idea with the Class on
Fractions,

AND: On an "exit ticket," 28 of the children were able to correctly identify a different fraction (2/5) on the number line.

What does it take to disrupt the patterns that marginalize and reinforce racism?





UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What does it take to disrupt the patterns that marginalize and reinforce racism?



Seeing Aniyah's explanation \bullet and Toni's question as key to the class's work



UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

Gholson & Martin, 2014; Langer-Osuna, 2015, 2017; Leonard &

Martin, 2013; Martin, 2012, 2015



45

What does it take to disrupt the patterns that marginalize and reinforce racism?



- Seeing Aniyah's explanation and Toni's question as key to the class's work
- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah



Gholson & Martin, 2014; Langer-Osuna, 2015, 2017; Leonard & Martin, 2013; Martin, 2012, 2015

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



What does it take to disrupt the patterns that marginalize and reinforce racism?

 \bullet



Gholson & Martin, 2014; Langer-Osuna, 2015, 2017; Leonard & Martin, 2013; Martin, 2012, 2015

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



Seeing Aniyah's explanation

brilliance of Black children, -

and thus Toni and Aniyah

Taking as axiomatic the

the class's work

and Toni's question as key to

Knowing and using mathematics in teaching (MKT)

Interpreting Toni as asking a mathematical question that she means

47

& TEACHINGWORKS

What does it take to disrupt the patterns that marginalize and reinforce racism?



Gholson & Martin, 2014; Langer-Osuna, 2015, 2017; Leonard & Martin, 2013; Martin, 2012, 2015

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

 Seeing Aniyah's explanation and Toni's question as key to the class's work

- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah
- ... AND having something different to DO



Knowing and using mathematics in teaching (MKT)

Interpreting Toni as asking a mathematical question that she means

What does it take to disrupt the patterns that marginalize and reinforce racism?



Gholson & Martin, 2014; Langer-Osuna, 2015, 2017; Leonard & Martin, 2013; Martin, 2012, 2015

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

CC) BY-NC-NDThis work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0
International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

 Seeing Aniyah's explanation and Toni's question as key to the class's work

- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah
- ... AND having something different to DO

environment

students

students

environment

Knowing and using mathematics in teaching (MKT)

Interpreting Toni as asking a mathematical question that she means

Having a repertoire of practices that can be adapted and used in contexts

Discretionary spaces lie in the many, many moment-to-moment moves, uses of language, and decisions that are inevitable in practice.

These are both crucial resources for supporting students and also where harm happens.



 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What would it take to learn to use the discretionary spaces in teaching in ways that advance students' mathematical flourishing?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Using the power of discretionary spaces to support BCPS learners

Where are high-leverage discretionary spaces in teaching mathematics that matter for students' mathematical flourishing?

Where are the discretionary spaces in YOUR work that matter for students' mathematical flourishing?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Where are high-leverage discretionary spaces in teaching mathematics that matter for students' mathematical flourishing?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

- Developing understanding 1. of core concepts, procedural fluency, mathematical reasoning, and automaticity
- Adapting the curriculum 2. for your students

Inherent discretionary spaces in teaching

Using language to explain 3. to students

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS





1. Developing understanding of core concepts and procedures, mathematical reasoning, and automaticity

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

В			Number Correct:		
Addit	ion Crossing a Ten		Improveme	:nt:	
1.	28 + 1 =	23.	75 + 7 =		
2.	37 + 2 =	24.	75 + 9 =		
3.	46 + 3 =	25.	66 + 4 =		
4.	55 + 4 =	26.	66 + 5 =		
5.	21 + 8 =	27.	66 + 6 =		
6.	32 + 7 =	28.	66 + 9 =		
7.	43 + 6 =	29.	54 + 6 =		
8.	54 + 5 =	30.	54 + 7 =		
9.	39 + 1 =	31.	54 + 8 =		
10.	39 + 2 =	32.	33 + 7 =		
11.	39 + 3 =	33.	33 + 8 =		
12.	39 + 5 =	34.	33 + 9 =		
13.	48 + 2 =	35.	42 + 8 =		
14.	48 + 3 =	36.	42 + 9 =		
15.	48 + 4 =	37.	49 + 1 =		
6.	48 + 6 =	38.	49 + 3 =		
7.	57 + 3 =	39.	58 + 2 =		
8.	57 + 4 =	40.	58 + 4 =		
Э.	57 + 5 =	41.	67 + 3 =		
Э.	57 + 7 =	42.	67 + 5 =		
	75 + 5 =	43.	85 + 5 =		
,	75 + 6 =	44	85 + 8 =		

You have 1 minute.

CC BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

The 8's Problem

Write down as many 8's as you want in a row. Insert plus (+) signs between them so that the expression equals 1000.

(You can put 8s together, e.g., 88.)

How many ways can you do this? Prove that you have found them all.

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu





 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Place the numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6 in the circles, using each number exactly once.

Place them so that when you add up the values in the three circles on each of three sides of the triangle, they total the same sum.



How many different solutions are there? Prove that you have found them all.

60

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Compare the three tasks.

- What mathematical knowledge and skills did each require of you?
- 2. What sorts of practice did each offer you?
- 3. Which were more challenging?

Sprint Addition Across Ten

В			Number Correct:		
Addi	tion Crossing a Ten		Improvem	ent:	
1.	28 + 1 =	23.	75 + 7 =		
2.	37 + 2 =	24.	75 + 9 =		
3.	46 + 3 =	25.	66 + 4 =		
4.	55 + 4 =	26.	66 + 5 =		
5.	21 + 8 =	27.	66 + 6 =		
6.	32 + 7 =	28.	66 + 9 =		
7.	43 + 6 =	29.	54 + 6 =		
8.	54 + 5 =	30.	54 + 7 =		
9.	39 + 1 =	31.	54 + 8 =		
10.	39 + 2 =	32.	33 + 7 =		
11.	39 + 3 =	33.	33 + 8 =		
12.	39 + 5 =	34.	33 + 9 =		
13.	48 + 2 =	35.	42 + 8 =		
14.	48 + 3 =	36.	42 + 9 =		
15.	48 + 4 =	37.	49 + 1 =		
16.	48 + 6 =	38.	49 + 3 =		
17.	57 + 3 =	39.	58 + 2 =		
8.	57 + 4 =	40.	58 + 4 =		
9.	57 + 5 =	41.	67 + 3 =		
0.	57 + 7 =	42.	67 + 5 =		
1.	75 + 5 =	43.	85 + 5 =		
2	75 + 6 =	44.	85 + 8 =		

8's Problem

Magic Triangle

61

Discretionary space #1: Developing understanding of core concepts and procedures, mathematical reasoning, and automaticity

Identify, develop, and construct alternative resources for combining these key mathematical goals

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



2. Adapting the curriculum for one's own students

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Multi-step word problems

Why are these important?

What are the challenges?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

M | MARSAL EDUCATION \gtrsim Teaching Works

Multi-step word problems

Why are these important?

- They are the types of problems that we more often face in everyday life
- They integrate different aspects of mathematical knowledge, procedural skill, and reasoning
- They are common on assessments

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What are the challenges?

Multi-step word problems

Why are these important?

- They are the types of problems that we more often face in everyday life
- They integrate different aspects of mathematical knowledge, procedural skill, and reasoning
- They are common on assessments

What are the challenges?

- Reading and interpreting the stories or situations
- Making sense: Problems in instructional materials are often not culturally relevant or do not make sense
- Language is often careless, even in high-quality instructional materials and on assessments

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



Mia has 152 beads. She uses some to make bracelets. Now there are 80 beads. If she uses 8 beads for each bracelet, how many bracelets does she make?

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

Mia has 152 beads. She uses some to make bracelets. Now there are 80 beads. If she uses 8 beads for each bracelet, how many bracelets does she make?

What are some issues with this problem?



Mia has 152 beads. She uses some to make bracelets. Now there are 80 beads. If she uses 8 beads for each bracelet, how many bracelets does she make?

What are some issues with this problem?

- What is the question referring to? The first set of bracelets? The second? Altogether?
- Is this a realistic situation?
- Are there students for whom this would be unfamiliar?

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

Revising word problems to manage these issues

- Understanding all the mathematics that is embedded in the word problem
- Maintaining the same mathematics
- Knowing contexts that would provide more relevance and make sense

would and bracelets. Now there are 80 beads. If she uses 8 beads for each bracelet, how many bracelets does she make?

Mia has 152 beads. She

uses some to make

• Using language with care

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

Mia has 152 beads. She uses some to make bracelets. Now there are 80 beads. If she uses 8 beads for each bracelet, how many bracelets does she make?

#1 The third graders baked 152 cookies to take to a nursing home. Their teacher already took some cookies over to the home and now there are 80 cookies left. If they pack 8 cookies in each box, how many boxes can they pack? **#2** 152 children go to Park School. It is pizza day and each child will get one slice of delicious pizza. The K–2 classes have already eaten their pizza. There are 10 pizzas left and each one is cut into 8 slices. If there are 80 children in the upper classes, is there enough pizza for everyone to have a slice?

MARSAL EDUCATION Z Teaching Works

71

Appraising revised problems

- Does the new problem preserve the mathematical structure and goals of the original problem?
- Is the new problem more relevant and sensible for my students?
- Is the language of the new problem free of unintended confusion or unknown ideas or words?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

BY-NC-ND

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu
Mia has 152 beads. She uses some to make bracelets. Now there are 80 beads. If she uses 8 beads for each bracelet, how many bracelets does she make?

#1 The third graders baked 152 cookies to take to a nursing home. Their teacher already took some cookies over to the home and now there are 80 cookies left. If they pack 8 cookies in each box, how many boxes can they pack?

Appraise each of these possible revisions. Make your own.

#2 152 children go to Park School. It is pizza day and each child will get one slice of delicious pizza. The K–2 classes have already eaten their pizza. There are 10 pizzas left and each one is cut into 8 slices. If there are 80 children in the upper classes, is there enough pizza for everyone to have a slice?

MARSAL EDUCATION 🔁 Teaching Works

73

 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Discretionary space #2: Adapting the curriculum for one's own students

Work collaboratively to revise lessons, problems, exit tickets to preserve the mathematical goals but be more relevant and sensible for one's own students

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



3. Using language to explain to students

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Even with a scripted curriculum, teachers have to say and explain things.

Significant mathematical slips are likely, which inadvertently "misteach."



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

What is wrong with each of these common statements?



 CC) BY-NC-ND
 This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0

 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

 © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

Discretionary space #3: Using language to explain to students

- Have opportunities to practice around common habits of language that create misunderstanding.
- Develop more awareness of this risk.
- Practice developing helpful ways to explain things that do not distort.

MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Where are the discretionary spaces in YOUR work that matter for students' mathematical flourishing?

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

- Ensuring pacing and coverage/going in depth
- Test taking skills/developing understanding and fluency
- Following the scripted curriculum/adapting to students

Emphasizing test scores/ developing positive mathematical identities

Dilemmas and tensions and your discretionary spaces



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 BY-NC-ND International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu MARSAL EDUCATION 🚝 Teaching Works

BCPS goals

- To improve district mathematical performance
- To support students to develop mathematical competence and positive mathematical identities

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

How do you use your discretionary spaces in your leadership practice?

- How do you lead in ways to manage these dilemmas and tensions?
- What signals do you send to teachers about each of these?

- Ensuring pacing and coverage/going in depth
- Test taking skills/developing understanding and fluency
- Following the scripted curriculum/adapting to students
- Emphasizing test scores/ developing positive mathematical identities

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu

M | MARSAL EDUCATION \cong Teaching Works

THANK YOU!



dball@umich.edu



https://deborahloewenbergball.com/

https://www.teachingworks.org/



@deborah_ball

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN | MARSAL FAMILY SCHOOL OF EDUCATION | TEACHINGWORKS



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Image on slide 2: Photo from "Former Uber security chief to face wire fraud charges for 2016 hack" by Vish Gain, SiliconRepublic.com. Retrieved from https://www.siliconrepublic.com/enterprise/uber-hack-data-breach-joesullivan-security-chief-wire-fraud



Image on slide 2: Photo from "What Is a Functional Behavior Assessment & Is It Effective?" by Rachel Wise, Education and Behavior. Retrieved from https://educationandbehavior.com/steps-for-conducting-a-functionalbehavior-assessment/



Image on slide 2: Screenshot of Baltimore City Public Schools homepage. Retrieved from https://www.baltimorecityschools.org/

MARSAL EDUCATION Z TeachingWorks



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Image on slides 16–18: Photo from "Why You Need an Experienced Real Estate Agent" by Elizabeth Weintraub, the balance. Retrieved from https://www.thebalance.com/experienced-real-estate-agents-1798883



Image on slides 16–18: Photo from "Black doctors earn less than white peers, study reveals" by Stacy M. Brown, The Philadelphia Tribune. Retrieved from https://www.phillytrib.com/lifestyle/health/black-doctors-earn-less-thanwhite-peers-study-reveals/article_2d359910-85c8-524b-b6d2-15d1705ad762.html



Image on slides 16-18: "Police." by Flickr user G20 Voice Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 2.0 Generic License https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0/

MARSAL EDUCATION Z TeachingWorks



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Image on slides 16-18: Photo from "Want to be a poll worker? Philly says it's responding to 'unprecedented' number of applicants" by Ximena Conde, WHYY Retrieved from https://whyy.org/articles/want-to-be-a-poll-worker-philly-says-itsresponding-to-unprecedented-number-of-applicants/



Image on slides 16–18: Photo from "Trump Rioters Storm U.S. Capitol (photos)," Variety Retrieved from https://variety.com/gallery/trump-rioters-storm-us-capitolphotos/congress-electoral-college-8/



Image on slides 17–18: Photo from "20 Classroom Interventions for Children with Anxiety Disorders" by Jerry Kennard, Ph.D., HealthCentral. Retrieved from https://www.healthcentral.com/article/20-classroom-interventions-forchildren-with-anxiety-disorders

MARSAL EDUCATION Z TeachingWorks



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/ © 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu



Image on slide 18: Photo from "10 Ways Well-Meaning White Teachers Bring Racism Into Our Schools" by Jamie Utt, *everyday feminism*. Retrieved from <u>https://everydayfeminism.com/2015/08/10-ways-well-meaning-white-teachers-bring-racism-into-our-schools/</u>



Image on slide 56:

"The strands of mathematical proficiency." National Research Council. 2001. Adding It Up: Helping Children Learn Mathematics. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. doi: 10.17226/9822.

MARSAL EDUCATION **Z** TeachingWorks

CC) BY-NC-NDThis work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0
International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
© 2024 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu